



## **Improving Hospitals Competitiveness through The Implementation of Total Quality Management (TQM)**

**Wahyudin Maguni**

FEBI IAIN Kendari Indonesia

**Ummi Kalsum**

FEBI IAIN Kendari Indonesia

**Alwahidin**

FEBI IAIN Kendari Indonesia

**Muhammad Imran**

FEBI IAIN Kendari

**Abdul Wahid Mongkito**

FEBI IAIN Kendari Indonesia

**Adzil Arsyi Sabana**

FEBI IAIN Kendari Indonesia

**Mansyur**

FTIK IAIN kendari

**Jalaluddin Rum**

FASYA IAIN Kendari Indonesia

**Sumiyadi**

FEBI IAIN Kendari Indonesia

Received: August 02, 2022; reviews: 2; accepted: November 18, 2022.

### **Abstract**

The implementation of total quality management in hospitals can be achieved only if the principles have been applied to quality improvement and patient safety programs. The purpose of this study is to analyze the role of the implementation of total quality management (TQM) on the competitiveness in hospitals. Finally, regarding total quality management in hospitals, it can be concluded that the application system of total quality management in hospitals has a quality standard in service for the future, namely patient satisfaction. One way to assess patient satisfaction can be measured through contact advice

and conducting training to improve service quality standards for every health worker who will provide services. Indeed, to improve the quality of health in hospitals, scientific approaches are needed such as the concepts of total quality management or integrated quality management.

### **Keywords**

Hospitals; Competitiveness; Total Quality Management; TQM; Hospital

### **Introduction**

Hospital is a health service institution for varieties communities with its own characteristics that are influenced by health science development, technology, and socio-economic life. This community has the capability to improve their services in quality and affordable as a guarantee in order to realize health degrees. Health problems have already become a basic need for the Indonesian people. Based on the Abukhader and Onbaşıoğlu statements (2021), they concluded that by increasing the living standard of people's daily lifestyle, directly, the demand for health quality in hospitals will also increase. Furthermore, this requires health service providers such as hospitals should be improved not only their quality of services for healing diseases but also preventive services ways in order to improve the quality of life and to give satisfaction to consumers as a patient as well as their family members as users.

On the other hand, hospitals are faced with various problems which were caused by changes in situations, conditions, selective standards, and competitive service users, until the end of the year. Indeed, according to Coelho (2022), there are found several problems that commonly occur in hospitals such as a lack of services for nurses or doctors; a carry out better medical functions; starting placing doctors; lacking in the implementation of good and innovative; developing management; having certain specialist doctors and nursing staff which reliable statistically.

Regarding the hospital problem, it is related to the history of the hospital that their community participation is very large which requires building trust in health services. Similar to the statements of Alshorah (2021); Alrabeah et al. (2020); and Alzoubi et al. (2019) who stated that there is still a lack of placement equipment to support this hospital was able to work professionally, appropriate with the hospital aim on supporting the implementation of good, accurate and safe medical services

Therefore, Total Quality Management is defined as the combination of all management functions, all parts of a company, and everyone into a holistic philosophy that is built on the concepts of quality, teamwork, productivity, and customer satisfaction (Alrabeah et al., 2020; Alzoubi et al., 2019). In addition, Alshorah (2021); Alrabeah et al. (2020); Alzoubi et al. (2019) also stated that total quality management is a philosophy and organizational culture that emphasizes

efforts to create quality management commitment through every aspect of organizational activities by requiring management commitment. Because it can give motivation to all members in the organization and contribute as much as possible to the organization that gives impacts the responsibility of all members in the organization. Indeed, Mohi and Makmur (2021); Tzortzopoulos (2018); Zaid et al. (2020) conclude that Integrated Quality Management is a much broader concept, which emphasizes not only the outcome aspect but also the quality of people and the quality of the process.

Furthermore, the implementation of total quality management in hospitals can be achieved only if the principles have been applied to quality improvement and patient safety programs. Thus, it can be implemented properly and adhere to several Total Quality Management principles. However, the principles of implementing still integrated quality management are proposed by Alzoubi et al. (2019); Babu and Thomas (2020). Then, it can be involved for all elements within a hospital by viewing each hospital member as a very valuable asset. The main focus is on meeting the needs and quality of services in the Hospitals. Thus, in the end, hopefully, the implementation of total quality management or integrated quality management in hospitals is expected.

Along with the application usage, the application of total quality management in a company can provide several main benefits which in turn will increase the profit and competitiveness of the company itself (Balasubramanian: 2021; Danuri et al.: 2021); Kamaruddin et al.: 2021). Then, companies can increase their profits through two routes which are carried out through continuous improvement. In health care institutions, patients can be classified as consumers while institutions are like a company with all employees and doctors classified as business actors in the health sector. According to Mohi and Makmur (2021); Bartels (2022); Zaid et al. (2020) stated that Total Quality Management (TQM) in the health sector must prioritize the fulfillment of service quality needs in the health sector by making continuous improvements to all aspects of the hospital.

The main area that really needs to be considered is related to service quality activities in hospitals. In addition, overall, the national weapons industry has implemented Total Quality Management (Alrabeah et al. (2020); Alzoubi et al. (2019). Moreover, Seyfried et al. (2022) shows that the implementation of Integrated Quality Management in the aspect of school services for students is quite good, the resources are good enough, the environment is good enough, the learning process is good, and the graduates are good. According to Abukhader and Onbaşıoğlu (2021); Alshourah (2021), it is described by indicators according to normative criteria (benchmarking) that are available, sustainable, acceptable and reasonable, achievable, accessible, understandable, and feasible.

The problem with this research is that in Indonesia, hospitals are experiencing rapid growth from time to time. There are 1,367 hospitals in Indonesia for 2021 (an increase of 8.83% from the previous year which was 1256), consisting of 805 government hospitals and 562 private hospitals. Hospital growth also

experienced a significant growth of 8.9%. Along with this growth, there was intense competition for hospitals to win the market in the hospital industry. Many things are done by hospitals to attract customers to take advantage of the hospital, starting from improving the quality of service, providing sophisticated medical equipment, adding types of services, services from professional human resources or by providing modern facilities and infrastructure. To be able to survive in the long term, an organization must be able to produce good performance, namely by providing effective and efficient work results, as well as remaining relevant to stakeholders 2002. This performance achievement can also be an answer to pressure from the government, insurance agencies and the community who demand a commitment from the hospital to be able to provide services in accordance with existing regulations. Hospitals have lower performance among hospitals in their class. This is indicated by not achieving the BOR according to the standards set by the Indonesian Ministry of Health of 60-85%, which is only in the range of 54.18% from 2015-2020. In addition, the hospital also has the lowest outpatient visits among other class hospitals, which is around 66 patients per day. Based on the background of the problem, the purpose of this study is to analyze the role of the implementation of total quality management (TQM) on the competitiveness in hospitals.

### **Method**

This research uses the literature review method of scientific articles with the topic of Total Quality Management. Literature review namely a systematic, explicit and reproducible method for identifying, evaluating and synthesizing research works and ideas that have been produced by researchers and practitioners. Researchers collect data through databases such as Pubmed, Sciencedirect, and Garuda journal articles with the topic of Total Quality Management. After collecting data through a database, the researcher uses the PRISMA (Preferre Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta Analysis) method. Data analysis is very important when conducting research, because data processing will relate to drawing conclusions. Analysis of the data used is by using thematic analysis. Thematic analysis is one way to get results by conducting data analysis that aims to identify patterns or determine themes through data that has been collected by research. Data analysis is very important when conducting research, because data processing will relate to drawing conclusions.

### **Discussion**

Hospitals need to implement a patient satisfaction-oriented management system that is well prepared and well planned by implementing an integrated quality management approach strategy or total quality management. According to Alshorah (2021) and Alzoubi et al. (2019) The application of integrated quality management that focuses on patients, refers to hospital regulations in which there

are supporting pillars in maintaining quality within the hospital such as the medical committee, and the nursing committee which supervises or implements quality management. Then, the maintenance of total quality management can be implemented and achieved through patient satisfaction in Hospitals based on Standard Operational Procedures (SOP) as the successful indicators. According to Alzoubi et al. (2019) One way of implementing total quality management can be accounted through the application of the Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) which is made and compiled by hospitals. In the implementation of integrated quality management that focuses on patients in Hospitals, of course, there are obstacles related to the existing infrastructure which is considered a necessity that needs to be improved continually. Then, services provided by the hospital have to continue and be improved by providing satisfaction to the patients.

According to Mohi and Makmur (2021) The implementation of total quality management in realizing a high obsession with quality in hospitals has provided a suggestion box and a call center for the community, if there are difficulties or input from the patient or outside the hospital. According to Tzortzopoulos (2018); Zaid et al. (2020) The patient can contact the call center from the hospital directly, and or can provide advice to the hospital in the suggestion box at the hospital as a form of contribution and patient feedback as a user. According to Junaidi (2022); Chams et al. (2021) The implementation of a total quality management system in hospitals can be improved continuously is driven by accreditation, wherein hospitals are required to improve the quality of service which is measured and evaluated every 6 (six) months. By going to the hospital system improvement, of course, there are obstacles, namely in terms of infrastructure that must continue to support hospitals. The implementation of total quality management in creating teamwork in hospitals has created a solid team collaboration among all health workers. It can happen through building interconnecting and interacting with each other member of the hospital and the accreditation standard by providing good and measurable services for each patient continually. Meanwhile, every decision-making involves all health workers in the hospitals, even the smallest thing is the same as the schedule even though it is set by one person but is discussed together only then there is a joint decision from all elements in it given the opportunity in stages. Total quality management will not be realized if it is not followed by a strong and serious determination from all health workers in hospitals.

According to de Souza et al. (2021); Junaidi (2022); Chams et al. (2021) there are six finding's main elements of the application in total quality management in hospitals, there are: 1) Fulfill patient satisfaction as always, 2) Carry out the division of tasks and responsibilities by empowering existing health workers, 3) Build solid teamwork, 4) Training and education for health workers, 5) Have a unified goal in implementing total quality management, and 6) Carry out continuous improvement by identifying and making improvements to needs by reviewing existing results. Meanwhile, based the principles of total quality management, it can be mentioned four influencing factors, there are: 1) Success

in improving management hospital still integrated with the quality of management that can be measured in patient satisfaction in hospitals, 2) Respect for everyone in hospitals clarifies that every health worker in the hospital is treated well and given the opportunity to develop themselves and participate in decision-making in the hospital in a collaborative manner level, 3) Create solid teamwork in improving the quality of services in hospitals as a part of management based, 4) For continuing the improvement, it is really important for hospitals, including on the improvement of integrated quality management achievement in hospitals or improvement on the implementation of quality services at the hospital which linear on national hospital accreditation standard that published on 2018 edition rules.

According to Permana et al. (2021); de Souza et al. (2021) Broadly speaking about the implementation of total quality management carried out in hospitals, the hard efforts that have been arranged by hospitals in realizing the vision, mission, and achievements with giving a service quality standard. However, it has been carried out by hospitals to assume that an integrated quality management standard in hospitals is something important and have to be implemented by all member and stakeholder in hospitals. According to Al-Otaibi et al. (2015); Junaidi (2022); Chams et al. (2021) Even, the implementation of total quality management in hospitals should be more expected that all health workers in hospitals will continue to be able to improve and prioritize a quality service in providing satisfaction to patients in hospitals.

In short, the stages of implementing total quality management or integrated quality management in hospitals separated into three, there are: 1) measuring a problem; 2) preparing SOPs, and the last 3) evaluating. As mentioned yet, the implementation of total quality management in hospitals needs to be carried out in stages that can provide space for the transition towards achieving service quality of hospitals.

Furthermore, some inhibiting factors of hospitals are the patient's family and also the lack of facilities and infrastructure that should be improved continually based on the evaluation. Meanwhile, the supporting factors in the implementation of total quality management in hospitals are health workers who are committed to better changes in improving the quality of health in hospitals. Besides that the physical environment in hospitals also still needs improvement for the purpose it can give support the progress of the hospitals in the process of quality service to patients based on total quality management. Whereas in the social environment, mutually supportive relationships are established between the surrounding community and the hospitals due to the community hospitals around there is no need to go to the hospital or in other areas because there are already existing health facilities and infrastructure in this area.

#### Managerial implications

Some implications that can be recommendations for hospitals in developing managerial policies are the results of this study show that basically hospitals are less competitive due to inadequate resources to provide services that can compete

with competing hospitals. Therefore, implementing an outsourced strategy can be an option for hospitals to meet resources that have not been met by hospitals. The results of research analysts regarding competitive advantages can also add to the information needed by hospitals to conduct needs analysis about products/services that must be developed or facilities that must be added. However, apart from that, hospitals should routinely conduct market surveys to understand market conditions including customer needs and the development of competing hospitals. The performance of the Public Relations and Marketing Section must be evaluated because it has not been maximized in carrying out marketing activities. This is illustrated by the low number of patient visits to the hospital. Then to overcome pressure from suppliers, although it is difficult to directly break the distribution chain of products from suppliers because the stock of these products must always be in the hospital, but if the hospital feels too pressured by the wishes of the supplier, the hospital can stop cooperation and switch to suppliers. other. This seems to be able to be done by the hospital considering that there are many choices of suppliers available. Hospital patients have loyalty, but that should not make the hospital complacent. This is because the performance of outpatient and inpatient visits is still relatively low. Therefore, the hospital must maximize the marketing process carried out to form a strong branding, such as socialization and promotion programs that have been started or maybe start developing other marketing methods to attract new customers/patients.

### **Conclusion**

Finally, regarding total quality management in hospitals, it can be concluded that the application system of total quality management in hospitals has a quality standard in service for the future, namely patient satisfaction. One way to assess patient satisfaction can be measured through contact advice and conducting training to improve service quality standards for every health worker who will provide services. Indeed, to improve the quality of health in hospitals, scientific approaches are needed such as the concepts of total quality management or integrated quality management.

Then, the existence of pillars that support maintaining quality within the hospitals are the medical committee and nursing committee which have responsibility on supervises or implementing integrated quality management. There is solid teamwork in providing good and measurable services for every patient in hospitals. Their respective fields according to their expertise and educational background can be used as indicators. In addition, the director needs to establish closer collaboration and communication with the committees in implementing total quality management or integrated quality management in hospitals also part of a necessary factor. It is expected that the implementation of total quality management or integrated quality management in hospitals is carried out according to its function. In short, hospitals can make positive changes in all aspects such as service to patients, facilities, and infrastructure, and can continue

to improve human resources in hospitals that are competent and professional.

### **References**

- Abukhader, K., & Onbaşıoğlu, D. (2021). The Effects of Total Quality Management Practices on Employee Performance and the Effect of Training as a Moderating Variable. *Uncertain Supply Chain Management*, 9(3), 521-528.
- Alshourah, S. (2021). Total Quality Management Practices and their Effects on the Quality Performance of Jordanian Private Hospitals. *Management Science Letters*, 11(1), 67-76.
- Alrabeah, A. H., Ogden, S., Edgar, D., & Fryer, K. (2020). Total Quality Management and Hospital Workforce National Cultural Diversity in Saudi Arabia: Help or Hindrance?. *International Journal of Research in Business Studies and Management*, 7(5), 18-30.
- Al-Otaibi, F. M. S., Alharbi, M. F., & Almeleehan, A. (2015). Effect of total quality management practices factors on the competitiveness: Evidence from Saudi Arabia. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 10(5), 85.
- Alzoubi, M. M., Hayati, K. S., Rosliza, A. M., Ahmad, A. A., & Al-Hamdan, Z. M. (2019). Total Quality Management in the Health-Care Context: Integrating the Literature and Directing Future Research. *Risk management and Healthcare policy*, 12, 167.
- Babu, F., & Thomas, S. (2020). The Relationship between Total Quality Management Practices and Organizational Image in the Hospital Industry: An Empirical Examination. *International Journal of Productivity and Quality Management*, 29(1), 1-23.
- Balasubramanian, M. (2021). Total Quality Management [TQM] in Hospitals—Challenges, Barriers, and Implementation Developing a Framework for TQM Implementation in Hospitals. *Issues and Development in Health Research*, 6 (1), 115-127.
- Bartels, R., Dudink, J., Haitjema, S., Oberski, D., & van't Veen, A. (2022). A Perspective on a Quality Management System for AI/ML-Based Clinical Decision Support in Hospital Care. *Frontiers in Digital Health*, 119.
- Chams, N., García-Blandón, J., & Hassan, K. (2021). Role reversal! financial performance as an antecedent of ESG: The moderating effect of total quality management. *Sustainability*, 13(13), 7026.
- Coelho, C., Mojtahedi, M., Kabirifar, K., & Yazdani, M. (2022). Influence of Organisational Culture on Total Quality Management Implementation in the Australian Construction Industry. *Buildings*, 12(4), 496.
- Danuri, H., Nugroho, M. N., & Ramadhan, Y. (2021). The Positive Effect of Total Quality Management (TQM) on the Achievement of Clinical Quality Indicators in Inpatient Units of Tangerang District Hospital Associated by Nurse Performance. *International Journal of Education Management and Social Science*, 2(4), 699-707.
- de Souza, F. F., Corsi, A., Pagani, R. N., Balbinotti, G., & Kovaleski, J. L. (2021).



- Total quality management 4.0: adapting quality management to Industry 4.0. *The TQM Journal*, 34(4), 749-769.
- Junaidi, J. (2022). The Effect of Corporate Governance, Integrated Quality Management and Social Responsibility on Competitiveness and Operational Performance. *Golden Ratio of Marketing and Applied Psychology of Business*, 2(2), 73-91.
- Kamaruddin, N. N., Rivai, F., & Zulkifli, A. (2021). An Analysis of The Effects of Total Quality Management (TQM) on Patient Satisfaction in Hospital: A Scoping Review. *Journal of Asian Multicultural Research for Medical and Health Science Study*, 2(4), 110 -129.
- Mohi, W. K., & Makmur, R. (2021). Total Quality Management (TQM) in BPJS Patient Services in MM Dunda Limboto Hospital. *Journal of Management and Administration Provision*, 1(2), 6-13.
- Permana, A., Purba, H. H., & Rizkiyah, N. D. (2021). A systematic literature review of Total Quality Management (TQM) implementation in the organization. *International Journal of Production Management and Engineering*, 9(1), 25-36.
- Seyfried, M., Döring, M., & Ansmann, M. (2022). The Sequence of Isomorphism— : The Temporal Diffusion Patterns of Quality Management in Higher Education Institutions and Hospitals. *Administration & Society*, 54(1), 87-116.
- Tzortzopoulos, A. (2018). Implementation of the Principles and Tools of Total Quality Management in the Healthcare Sector-Guarantee of Quality Improvement of Hospitals and the National Health System. *Archives of Hellenic Medicine*, 35(5), 649-664.
- Zaid, A. A., Arqawi, S. M., Mwais, R. M. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Abu-Naser, S. S. (2020). The Impact of Total Quality Management and Perceived Service Quality on Patient Satisfaction and Behavior Intention in Palestinian Healthcare Organizations. *Technology Reports of Kansai University*, 62 (03), 221-232.